

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Emma McArthur** <ejminoz@gmail.com>

Date: Wed, 6 Jul 2022 at 10:44

Subject: Evaluation of the Covid-19 response

To: <premier@sa.gov.au>

Cc: <senator.rennick@aph.gov.au>, <senator.antic@aph.gov.au>, <senator.roberts@aph.gov.au>, Elizabeth Hart <elizmhart@gmail.com>, <nicola.spurrier@flinders.edu.au>, <black@parliament.sa.gov.au>, <ministerforhealth@sa.gov.au>, <schubert@parliament.sa.gov.au>, <mark.butler.mp@aph.gov.au>

**For the attention of:**

Peter Malinauskas  
Leader of the SA Labor Party  
Premier of South Australia

Dear Mr Malinauskas

With the Covid-19 fiasco now dragging into its third year, an urgent evaluation of the Covid-19 response is essential – particularly in light of the growing body of evidence demonstrating that lockdowns and other Covid-19 policies have done more harm than good. The ongoing lack of transparency and political accountability from state and federal politicians is a disgrace, and it is time for it to stop.

Australian economist Gigi Foster recently undertook a cost-benefit analysis of Australia's lockdown policies, stating in an [article](#) for Brownstone Institute on 17 May 2022 (attached):

**'even under assumptions highly generous towards lockdowns, the maximum number of COVID deaths postponed by Australia's lockdowns and border closures is about 10,000. This compares to a quantity of human damage directly due to lockdowns that is over thirty times greater than the human savings represented by those 10,000 lives.'**

The response to Covid-19 has been a disaster, particularly for [children and young people](#) who have been forced to carry an unnecessary burden. They will also bear the broader socioeconomic impact of lockdowns in the years ahead.

What sort of society sacrifices the well-being of its young in order to (purportedly) protect the elderly, Mr Malinauskas?

Covid-19 is globally endemic, and it is way past time that Australians learnt to 'live with the virus.' The public must no longer be left prey to the likes of University of South Australia's Adrian Esterman and his fear-mongering about the return of Covid-19 restrictions in the Adelaide [Advertiser](#). (See attached article dated 27 June 2022)

The fusion of health with national security, under the guise of a 'biosecurity' agenda, appears to have facilitated the authoritarian global response to Covid-19. The increasing hysteria about infectious disease and pandemics (cue monkeypox), perpetuated by the World Health Organization and other vested interests, represents a significant threat to the well-being of humanity; far greater than the risk of Covid-19. Governments have abused emergency powers in the name of 'public

health', creating a medical tyranny under the direction of a band of non-elected, non-accountable health officers and other so-called 'experts.'

And now, if legal analysis is correct, **your government seems to have made such powers a permanent feature of our lives** with the Public Health (COVID-19) Amendment Bill 2022. This appears to decouple many of the Covid-19 measures from the state of emergency. The Law Society of South Australia [notes](#) the lack of provision for individual rights saying: **'There does not seem to be any reference in the legislation to safeguards to ensure a proportionate response that has regard to an individual's basic rights.'** (See attached media release.)

**This has all been done without proper scrutiny, and with little scientific evidence to justify such blatant authoritarianism.**

Mr Malinauskas, when you were opposition leader in April 2020, Elizabeth Hart [wrote to you](#) asking for the evidence regarding the draconian measures being forced upon the Australian public, in the response to Covid-19.

In [your reply](#), you stated:

**'As an Opposition party we do not have access to the same advice as either the Federal or State Government, so as this crisis has unfolded, along with other members of the Parliamentary Labor Team, I have been focussed on working in a constructive manner with the State Government.'**

Given that the Australian people were facing the biggest peacetime removal of their fundamental rights and freedoms in history, **was it your role as opposition leader to focus on 'working in a constructive manner with the State Government'?**

Did you ever consider that, instead of resigning yourself to not having **'access to the same advice as either the State or Federal Government'**, perhaps it was **your duty** to demand the evidence underpinning the State Government's response and provide it to the public? **In a true democracy, surely the job of the opposition is to hold the government to account for its policies and decisions, not roll over and acquiesce without question?**

The apathy in your reply to Elizabeth Hart cuts to the heart of the issue regarding the response to Covid-19 – **political accountability has evaporated in Australia, and we no longer have an effective adversarial parliamentary system that is so essential to a functioning democracy.** It seems that no matter who the public vote for, they end up with the same lacklustre political drudgery.

Why has it been left up to individuals, such as myself and Elizabeth Hart, to demand accountability from our elected representatives? Why are we doing the job of politicians who are paid by the Australian taxpayer to represent our interests?

For example, why did you not ask – [as I did in July 2021](#) – why the then Prime Minister, Scott Morrison, abandoned Australia's existing Pandemic Plan in March 2020, to pursue an authoritarian suppression strategy, with a vaccine solution as the only way out? (See attached) Why did you not demand the medical justification for this grotesque suppression of our fundamental rights and freedoms, **particularly as it was known from February 2020 that COVID-19 was not a serious risk to most people?**

[Early data](#) showed that Covid-19 had a steep age gradient in mortality, with [elderly people](#) with comorbidities at increased risk of serious illness and death.[1-3] This was also stated by Australia's former Chief Medical Officer, [Brendan Murphy](#), and current Chief Medical Officer, [Paul Kelly](#), during February 2020. Current [Australian Covid-19 data](#) supports this. [Australian Bureau of Statistics](#) data from March 2022, shows a median age of death from Covid-19 of 83.8 years – 82.3 for

males and 86 for females. In 2020, the [median age at death](#) in Australia was 79 years for males and 85 years for females.

**Has the Chief Public Health Officer, Nicola Spurrier, advised you of these facts, Mr Malinauskas?** Has Ms Spurrier told you that estimates suggest a [global infection fatality rate of 0.15%](#), which is not dissimilar to influenza,[4] and for the under 70s it is [0.05%](#)? [5] Have you been advised that Covid-19 poses [little risk](#) to children?[6-12]

To date, no one in government has answered my questions, nor presented any evidence to support the decisions made. There has been no explanation as to why many of the measures employed in the response to Covid-19 go against the recommendations in the [Australian Health Management Plan for Pandemic Influenza \(AHMPPI\)](#). Even Senator Alex Antic – one of the few politicians demanding political accountability regarding the response to Covid-19 – has [struggled](#) to get any scientific evidence for the Covid-19 policies from SA Health.

Mr Malinauskas, now you are in government and presumably have access to the 'same advice', **perhaps you can finally explain why the AHMPPI was abandoned?** Please can you answer the following:

- Why was Australian society shut down – at vast cost to the Australian taxpayer – when according to the AHMPPI, and the [SA Health Viral Respiratory Disease Pandemic Response Plan \(VRDPR Plan\)](#), decision makers should aim to **provide a response that is proportional to the level of risk, make the best use of the resources available, and minimise disruption to the community?**
- Were these public health measures **ever proportional to the level of risk**, when it was known from the beginning that Covid-19 was not a serious risk to most people?
- Why have governments in Australia, and across the world, done the precise opposite of what was recommended under [existing pandemic planning](#), including [WHO 2019 Non-pharmaceutical public health measures for mitigating the risk and impact of epidemic and pandemic influenza guidelines](#)?
- **Why have individual rights and freedoms been trashed**, and societal functioning disrupted, through lockdowns, border closures, contact tracing, mass-testing and compulsory quarantining of healthy people, compulsory community masking and vaccine mandates, going against the fundamental [ethical principles](#) of public health?
- Why are children and young people being turned into human guinea pigs and pressed to take [experimental Covid-19 injections](#), **which have no long-term safety data**, when they are at minimal risk from the disease itself?
- Why was such a heavy-handed approach undertaken, when it is in direct opposition to ethical principles in the AHMPPI and the [Australian Health Sector Emergency Response Plan for Novel Coronavirus \(COVID-19 plan\)](#), both of which state that **the rights of the individual should be 'upheld as much as possible'**?

As I pointed out in my letter to Scott Morrison, and also to [Police Commissioner Stevens](#) (see attached), the AHMPPI, the COVID-19 plan, and the South Australian VRDPR Plan all state that **'measures will rely on voluntary compliance rather than legal enforcement wherever possible.'**

Given the draconian response to Covid-19, this is almost laughable; but there is nothing funny about the state sanctioned abuse of personal autonomy and bodily integrity.

A thorough and transparent investigation into the Covid-19 response must be urgently undertaken to prevent further harm to our society. The egregious intrusions upon the lives of Australian people must stop and must never be repeated.

It is time for you to step up and be accountable to the people, Mr Malinauskas – do you want to be a leader, or do you want to join the sorry ranks of the Covid-19 tyrants that have gone before you?

Yours sincerely

Emma McArthur

### **Independent researcher investigating the Covid-19 response and taxpayer-funded public health policy**

[humanityattheprecipice.com](http://humanityattheprecipice.com)

### **References**

1. Russell TW et al., [Estimating the infection and case fatality ratio for coronavirus disease \(COVID-19\) using age-adjusted data from the outbreak on the Diamond Princess cruise ship, February 2020](#), Euro Surveill, 2020, 25(1), doi:10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.25.12.2000256
2. Kuldorff M, [COVID-19 Counter Measures Should be Age Specific](#), LinkedIn, 10 April 2020
3. Ioannidis JPA et al., [Population-level COVID-19 mortality risk for non-elderly individuals overall and for non-elderly individuals without underlying diseases in pandemic epicenters](#), JAMA Intern Med, 2020, 180(7):927–928, doi:10.1001/jamainternmed.2020.1447
4. Ioannidis JPA, [Reconciling estimates of global spread and infection fatality rates of COVID-19: An overview of systematic evaluations](#), Eur J Clin Invest, 2021, 51:e13554, doi:10.1111/eci.13554
5. Ioannidis JPA, [Infection fatality rate of COVID-19 inferred from seroprevalence data](#), Bulletin of the World Health Organization, 2021, 99: 19-33F, doi:10.2471/BLT.20.265892
6. Ludvigsson JF et al., [Open Schools, Covid-19, and Child and Teacher Morbidity in Sweden](#), N Engl J Med, 2021, 384(7):669-671, doi:10.1056/NEJMc2026670
7. Lewis S et al., [Closing schools is not evidence based and harms children](#), British Medical Journal, 2021, 372:n521, [doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n521](https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n521)
8. [Covid-19 in schoolchildren - A comparison between Finland and Sweden](#), Swedish Public Health Agency, 7 July 2020
9. Brandal LT et al., [Minimal transmission of SARS-CoV-2 from paediatric COVID-19 cases in primary schools](#), Norway, August to November 2020, Euro Surveill, 2021, 26(1):pii=2002011, [doi.org/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.26.1.2002011](https://doi.org/10.2807/1560-7917.ES.2020.26.1.2002011)
10. Boast A et al., [An evidence summary of Paediatric COVID-19 literature](#), Don't Forget the Bubbles, 2020
11. [Global Covid-19 Case Fatality Rates](#), Centre for Evidence Based Medicine, 7 October 2020
12. Smith C et al., [Deaths in Children and Young People in England following SARS-CoV-2 infection during the first pandemic year](#), medRxiv 2021.07.07.21259779, [doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.07.21259779](https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.07.07.21259779)