

## Emma McArthur

---

**From:** Emma McArthur <ejminoz@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, 17 July 2020 11:19 AM  
**To:** heysen@parliament.sa.gov.au  
**Subject:** C-19 information as discussed

Dear Josh

I can't thank you enough for meeting with me yesterday, and for listening to what I had to say.

As I outlined to you, my family's experience in the UK is just one example of the potential damage caused by lockdown policies, particularly on the most vulnerable who we are supposed to be protecting. I hope the information below is useful and can be used to steer us towards a more open public discussion of the evidence base surrounding Covid-19 and the impacts of government policy responses.

The document I provided you, by Professor Carl Heneghan from the Centre for Evidence Based Medicine at the University of Oxford, although written for a UK context, provides an excellent starting point for this discussion. The original document can be found here, <https://senseaboutscience.org/activities/a-better-conversation/>. The Centre for Evidence Based Medicine can be found here <https://www.cebm.net/oxford-covid-19-evidence-service/> where there is a great deal of research on Covid-19 data.

Interviews with Professor Johan Giesecke from Sweden can be found here <https://youtu.be/bfN2JWifLCY> and here <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H2TEOnOnHVM>. The second interview is from Sky News Australia and has a discussion about Australian policy.

Another interview with a doctor from Sweden discussing t-cell immunity and Covid-19 in Sweden, can be found here <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CwQpg62Kflg>

A research group from Oxford University released a paper in March modelling Covid-19 and has also been researching Covid-19 immunity. An interview with epidemiologist Professor Sunetra Gupta from Oxford can be found here <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DKh6kJ-RSMI>. In addition, Professor Gupta was interviewed by the Australian on 3 July about our approach and is available online. A pre-print of her paper about Covid-19 immunity can be found here <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.07.15.20154294v1>

As we discussed, there is a growing body of evidence, in the form of empirical data, in regards to the risk factors for Covid-19 and its transmission, as well as the potential negative economic, social, health and educational impact of Covid-19 policies. Scientists examining the data have stated that Covid-19 appears to be following a similar trajectory across societies, irrespective of government lockdown policies. As Professor Giesecke states, an important factor in managing Covid-19 is protecting those most at risk, such as the elderly, A failure to protect care homes appears to be a growing factor in this crisis globally. Sweden has had relatively high numbers of deaths in care homes, but so have the UK and New York - despite strict lockdown policies in these two locations. In both New York and the UK, this appears to be as a result of elderly people being sent into care homes with Covid-19, allowing the virus to spread through the most vulnerable age-group.

Nobel Prize winner, Michael Levitt, has been analysing Covid-19 data from the beginning, and he is openly sharing his data in order to drive scientific debate and better policy responses. Michael has done several interviews about his analysis, including with former deputy Prime Minister of Australia, John Anderson, which can be found here <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yn5BGHuK1zo>. Another interview can be found here <https://unherd.com/thepost/nobel-prize-winning-scientist-the-covid-19-epidemic-was-never-exponential/>

Michael's research can be found here <https://med.stanford.edu/levitt.html>

Another collaborative of scientists is PANDA from South Africa, who have been analysing Covid-19 data, including inter-country variability. Their research can be found here <https://www.pandata.org.za/papers/>.

A recent paper co-authored by Professor Sally Cripps from the University of Sydney and epidemiologist Doctor John Ioannidis from Stanford University, discusses the failures in Covid-19 modelling and can be found here <https://forecasters.org/blog/2020/06/14/forecasting-for-covid-19-has-failed/>.

For lighter reading, there are also multiple articles in Spectator magazine by Dr John Lee. Whilst not academic papers, they provide an interesting overview for those with non-medical backgrounds.

Thank you again for your time. I appreciate the work you and your colleagues are doing for South Australia. I hope what I have shared can add to the debate, and help us find a compassionate and humane way out of the current crisis.

Warm regards  
Emma